

A SURVEY ON COMPARISON BETWEEN PSYCHOLOGICAL AND SOCIAL PROBLEMS FACED BY STUDENTS OF MUNICIPAL CORPORATION RUN SCHOOLS VS PRIVATE SCHOOLS

1)Dr Mansvi Zarivala Asst prof of psychiatry AMC MET medical college Ahmedabad 2) Dr Vaishal N. Vora, M.D.(Psychiatry), D.P.M. , Consultant Psychiatrist, Chairman, Arjav mental health and research foundation , Maninagar, Ahmedabad 3 Ms.Rohini Pandya, M.A.(Clinical Psychology), P.G.D.A.C.C.P.T, Consulting Psychologist, Arjav Mental Health and Research Foundation, Maninagar, Ahmedabad.

Corresponding author, Dr Vaishal N. Vora, M.D.(Psychiatry),

Abstract

Introduction- There is a common perception in the society that private run schools are much better at preparing students for the real world when compared to government of municipal corporation run schools. At the same time, it is also very important to understand the challenges faced by students of both the types of educational institutions since an appropriate and targeted counselling based intervention and in the further step, prophylactic counselling tools can be designed, targeted at both the types of institutes. In a world where students live with teachers more than with their own parents it is also very important to understand their grievances and insecurities and solve them by a bipartisan approach using all the resources at our disposal.

Aim – This study is aimed at comparing the problems of Municipal Corporation run school's students vs Private School's students

Materials and Methods –A total of 620 Students from standard 6th and 7th were surveyed of which, 383 Students were from Municipal Corporation run schools and 237 students were from Private schools. They were individually asked questions by their teachers over a period of 5 months from Dr Bhatt's Counseling Inventory, which is a form with 76 "Agree" "Disagree" option based Questions.

Results and Discussion – The results showed a significant similarity in the problems faced by each school type students. While it would be incorrect to validate a particular School type as better based on a small study, this study could get a bird-eye view of the challenges that students of each school type are facing. While students from Private schools had more difficulty in relations with Parents, Peers and Teachers, Corporation run school's students had more general health problems. Social confidence difficulties were more prevalent amongst corporation run school's students as compared to the latter.

Conclusion – Based on this study, counseling modules should be made to intervene the psychosocial problems faced by these students and also to prevent these psychosocial problems. The private school students had more strained relationships while the Municipal Corporation run school's students had more Confidence and General Health Issues.

Keywords- School Health, Psychosocial, Child Psychiatry

Keywords- School Health, Psychosocial, Child Psychiatry

Introduction:

- School Health in India is a highly debated and publicised topic and rightly so, since schooling of a child would determine the future assets and drawbacks of a child. Proper Psychoanalysis and timely intervention and prophylaxis can immensely influence in helping a child becoming mentally health. According to a study, among 11–15 year olds, 6% had a severe lack of friendship: 9% of those with mental disorders and 5% with no disorder. ¹ As per National Alliance of Mental Health, 20% of youth ages 13-18 live with a mental health condition, 11% of youth have a mood disorder, 10% of youth have behaviour or conduct disorder, 8% of youth have an anxiety disorder². Worldwide 10-20% of children and adolescents experience mental disorders. Half of all mental illnesses begin by the age of 14 and three- quarters by mid-20s ³.

Table 1:-Prevalence of Psychiatric disorders amongst adolescents in India classified based on Gender and Area of residence as per National Mental Health Survey by NIMHANS⁴

Characteristics	Prevalence (95% CI)
Any mental morbidity	7.3 (5.8-8.7)
Gender	
Male	7.5 (5.1-9.8)
Female	7.1 (5.1-9.0)
Place of residence	
Rural	6.9 (4.0-9.7)
Urban	4.3 (2.3-6.2)
Urban Metro	13.5 (10.4-16.5)

As per the National Mental Health survey conducted by National Institute of Mental Health and Neuro Sciences, the overall prevalence of any mental morbidity in adolescents was 7.3% with a similar distribution between males and females (M: 7.5%; F:7.1%). Interestingly, the problem in urban metro regions was higher as compared to rural and urban non-metro areas (13.5% vs. 6.9% and 4.3% respectively). Common Mental disorders constituted to 5.4% of the disease burden and Neurotic and stress related disorders contributed to about 4.2% of the current burden ⁴

Table 2:- shows classification of mental disorders and their prevalence amongst adolescents in India as per National Mental Health Survey by NIMHANS⁴

Diagnostic Categories	Prevalence (95% CI)
Depressive Episode & Recurrent Depressive Disorder	0.8 (0.3 – 1.4)
Agoraphobia	2.3 (1.4-3.1)
Intellectual Disability	1.7 (1.0 - 2.4)
Autism Spectrum Disorder	1.6 (0.9-2.3)
Phobic Anxiety Disorder	3.6 (2.6 - 4.7)
Dysthymia	0.8 (0.2-1.3)
Social Phobia	0.8 (0.3-1.4)
Conduct disorders including Oppositional Defiant Disorder	0.8 (0.3-1.4)
Bipolar Affective Disorder	0.6 (0.1-1.0)

There is a dire deficiency of such surveys in Gujarat, based on which Psychoanalytic and Psychotherapy tools can be devised and used for public welfare.

Aim:

- This study is aimed at comparing the psychosocial problems of Municipal Corporation run school's students vs. Private School's students.
- It is also aimed to determine dimension wise difficulties (Psycho social Dimensions) faced by subject population.

Materials and Methods:

Subject Population-A total of 620 Students from standard 7th were surveyed of which, 310 Students were from Municipal Corporation run schools and 310 students were from Private schools.

Instrument- Dr Bhatt's Counseling Inventory, which is a form with 76 "Agree" "Disagree" option, based Questions.

The main task for the project is to select an appropriate and precise standardized psychological tool for initial screening of the children. The psychological test which will be used for initial screening is a test named Counselling Inventory; it is a standardized test which can be administered in a group setting. This test measures a child on seven different day to day life areas wherein he tends to have or develop problems leading into future pathology. The seven different areas that the test measures are:

1. Relations with the family
2. Relations with teachers
3. Relations with peers(friends)
4. General Health
5. Irritability
6. Social Confidence
7. Lie Scale

Scoring, Interpretation and Identification- Once the test is administered the next step is to evaluate (score) each child's performance on the test. This evaluation helps in identifying those students who have problems as well as the area in which the child has a problem and needs intervention.

Inclusion Criteria-

- 7th Standard students were selected from both Municipal Corporation run schools and Private run schools
- Consent was taken from the parents and teachers of each child.

Exclusion Criteria-

- Students whose Parents or Teachers did not give consent
- Students with a known major organic illness ,which can cause psychological impact

Result and Analysis:

Study Population: A total of 620 students were evaluated. The sample size of contained 7th standard students from both type of schools i.e. Corporation run schools and Private schools in equal amount each i.e. 310.

Table 3

Sex of Students	Corporation run School	Private School	<u>Total</u>
Male	215	170	385
Female	95	140	235
Total	310	310	620

As per Table 3 the School wise and Gender wise distribution of the study population shows that 69.35% of Municipal Corporation run school's students were Males whereas the remaining 30.65% were females. In private run schools, 54.8% students were Males whereas, 45.2% were Females. Of the Total population studied, 62.1% were Males and 37.9% were Females. Of the total population studies, 50% belonged to Municipal Corporation run schools, whereas 50% belonged to Private Schools.

Table 4:- Difficulties faced by Students in Various Domains classified based on the type of school

Difficulty Faced in Category	Municipal Corporation run Schools' Students	Private Schools' Students	Total
Relation with Family	12	3	15

Relation with Teachers	6	4	10
Relation with Peers	5	8	13
General Health	14	3	17
Irritability	8	11	19
Social Confidence	9	3	12
Lie Scale	20	16	36

This table shows the classification of Difficulties faced by students in various domains based on the type of their school. Of the 620 students studied 2.42% had Relationship issues with family, of which 80% were belonging to Municipal Corporation, run schools whereas 20% belong to Private Schools. Of the 620 students studied 1.61% had Relationship issues with teachers, of which 60% were belonging to Municipal Corporation, run schools whereas 40% belong to Private Schools. Of the 620 students studied 2.1% had Relationship issues with Peers, of which 38.46% were belonging to Municipal Corporation, run schools whereas 61.54% belong to Private Schools. Of the 620 students studied 2.74% had General Health Issues, of which 82.35% were belonging to Municipal Corporation run schools whereas 17.65% belong to Private Schools. Of the 620 students studied 3.06% had Issues in Irritability Domain, of which 42.1% were belonging to Municipal Corporation run schools whereas 57.9% belong to Private Schools. Of the 620 students studied 1.93% had issues in Social Confidence Domain, of which 75% were belonging to Municipal Corporation run schools whereas 25% belong to Private Schools. Of the 620 students studied 5.8% had Issues in Lying Domain, of which 55.55% were belonging to Municipal Corporation run schools whereas 44.45% belong to Private Schools.

Table 5:- Difficulty faced by students in the Relationship Domain

Difficulty in Relation with	Corporation run Schools			Private Schools		
	Males	Females	Total	Males	Females	Total
Family	9	3	12	1	2	3
Teachers	5	1	6	2	2	4
Peers	1	4	5	2	6	8

As per table 5, Out of the 12 students of Municipal Corporation run schools having relationship issues with family, 75% were Males and 25% were Females. Out of the 3 students of Private schools having relationship issues with family, 33.33% were Males and 66.67% were Females. Out of the 6 students of Municipal Corporation run schools having relationship issues with Teachers, 83.33% were Males and 16.67% were Females. Out of the 4 students of Private schools having relationship issues with teachers, 50% were Males and 50% were Females. Out of the 5 students of Municipal Corporation run schools having relationship issues with peers, 20% were Males and 80% were Females. Out of the 8 Private school students having relationship issues with peers, 25% were Males and 75% were Females.

Table 6:- Difficulty faced by students in General Health domain

Category	Corporation run Schools			Private Schools		
	Males	Females	Category	Males	Females	Category
General Health Difficulty	10	4	14	2	1	3

As per Table 6, Out of the 14 students of Municipal Corporation run schools having General Health Difficulty, 71.43% were Males and 28.6% were Females. Out of the 3 students of Municipal Corporation run schools having General Health issues, 66.67% were Males and 33.33% were Females.

Table 7:- Portraying difficulty in irritability and social confidence issues domain in students

Category	Corporation run Schools			Private Schools		
	Males	Females	Category	Males	Females	Category
Irritability	6	2	8	7	4	11
Social Confidence	4	5	9	1	2	3

As per Table 7, Out of the 8 students of Municipal Corporation run schools having issues in irritability domain, 75% were Males and 25% were Females. Out of the 11 students of Private schools having issues in irritability domain, 63.64% were Males and 36.36% were Females. Out of the 9 students of Municipal Corporation run schools having Social Confidence issues, 44.44% were Males and 55.56% were Females. Out of the 3 students of Private schools having Social Confidence issues, 33.33% were Males and 66.67% were Females.

Table 8:- Portraying issues of students in lying domain

	Corporation run Schools			Private Schools		
Category	Males	Females	Category	Males	Females	Category
Lie Scale	15	5	20	10	6	16

As per Table 8, Out of the 20 students of Municipal Corporation run schools having Lying issues, 75% were Males and 25% were Females. Out of the 16 students of Private schools having lying issues, 62.5% were Males and 37.5% were Females.

Discussion:

Since a study with this target population and aim has not been performed earlier, it would be non-scientific to compare it with other target group studies. The results showed a significant similarity in the problems faced by each school type students. While it would be incorrect to validate a particular School type as better based on a small study, this study could get a bird-eye view of the challenges that students of each school type are facing. While students from Private schools had more difficulty in relations with Parents, Peers and Teachers, Corporation run school's students had more general health problems. Social confidence difficulties were more prevalent amongst corporation run school's students as compared to the latter.

The main findings of this study were,

- Of the 620 students studied 2.42% had Relationship issues with family, of which 80% were belonging to Municipal Corporation, run schools whereas 20% belong to Private Schools.
- Of the 620 students studied 1.61% had Relationship issues with teachers, of which 60% were belonging to Municipal Corporation, run schools whereas 40% belong to Private Schools.
- Of the 620 students studied 2.1% had Relationship issues with Peers, of which 38.46% were belonging to Municipal Corporation, run schools whereas 61.54% belong to Private Schools.
- Of the 620 students studied 2.74% had General Health Issues, of which 82.35% were belonging to Municipal Corporation run schools whereas 17.65% belong to Private Schools.
- Of the 620 students studied 3.06% had Issues in Irritability Domain, of which 42.1% were belonging to Municipal Corporation run schools whereas 57.9% belong to Private Schools.
- Of the 620 students studied 1.93% had issues in Social Confidence Domain, of which 75% were belonging to Municipal Corporation run schools whereas 25% belong to Private Schools.
- Of the 620 students studied 5.8% had Issues in Lying Domain, of which 55.55% were belonging to Municipal Corporation run schools whereas 44.45% belong to Private Schools.

Except for Social Confidence Difficulties, Male students had more difficulty in various domains as compared to Female students. The study "The relationship among bullying, victimisation, depression, anxiety and aggression in elementary school children" also showed that Male students had much more prevalence of Relationship issues with peers when compared to Females⁵. When compared with "Prevalence of Behaviour Problems among School Children and their Demographic Correlates" study, this study correlates in the aspect that Males have a higher incidence of behavioural problems like irritability when compared with females⁶. This study was in accordance with "Government versus

private primary schools in India: An assessment of physical infrastructure, schooling costs and performance" in the aspect that Private school students were much more socially confident when compared to Corporation or Govt. run school students ⁷

Conclusion:

- Based on this survey, counseling modules should be made to intervene the psychosocial problems faced by these students and also to prevent these psychosocial problems. The private school students had more strained relationships while the Municipal Corporation run school's students had more Confidence and General Health Issues.
- At the same time more studies like these should be encouraged and conducted targeted at individual standards so that an active Psychological intervention and aid can be provided to the students based and targeted completely on their needs, without adding a burden to the already exhaustive education system.

References:

1. H. MELTZER¹ , R. GATWARD¹ , R. GOODMAN² & T. FORD². *Mental health of children and adolescents in Great Britain*, 15, ed. London: International Review of Psychiatry (2003), 15, 185–187; 2003.
2. <https://www.nami.org/getattachment/Learn-More/Mental-Health-by-the-Numbers/childrenmhfacts.pdf>
3. http://www.who.int/mental_health/maternal-child/child_adolescent/en/
4. National Mental Health Survey 2015-2016 as per National Institute of Mental Health and Neurosciences
<http://www.nimhans.ac.in/sites/default/files/u197/NMHS%20Report%20%28Prevalence%20patterns%20and%20outcomes%29%201.pdf>
5. Wendy M. Craig, The relationship among bullying, victimisation, depression, anxiety and aggression in elementary school children, 24, ed. *Personality and Individual Differences Journal* (1998), 24, 123-130 ; 1998
6. Sushma Basavaiah Vijayaprakash, Srinivasan Venkatesan, Khyrunnisa Begum, Prevalence of Behavior Problems among School Children and their Demographic Correlates, Vol. 1, *Guru Journal of Behavioral and Social Sciences* (2013), Vol 1 Issue 4, 203-212; 2013
7. Jitendra Gouda, Kailash Chandra Das, Srinivas Goli, Ladumai Maikho Apollo Pou, (2013) "Government versus private primary schools in India: An assessment of physical infrastructure, schooling costs and performance", *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy*, Vol. 33 Issue: 11/12, pp.708-724, <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJSSP-12-2012-0105>